

Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

# COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

### **FIRST LANDMARKS MEETING**

1. **\*116 Waverly Pl.** – Application is to replace the rear wall.

(withdrawn)



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

# COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org
P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village \* Little Italy \* SoHo \* NoHo \* Hudson Square \* Chinatown \* Gansevoort Market

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

2. **\*489 Broadway** - Application is to renovate the facade and entryway, and install a commercial service window on the Broome St. side of the building.

#### Whereas,

- A. The bricked -up bays of the facade on the Broome Street facade are to be opened and fitted with infill of similar design and materials to the bays renovated under a prior application; and
- B. A service window with a swinging casement to sell goods to passersby occupies the central of the three bays; and
- C. The bay containing the entrance blends well with the design of the other bays; and

D A bay which is blocked by interior construction creates a condition where there is no depth behind the glass, so it is proposed to be used as a full size sign vitrine that detracts from the historic character of the building; now

Therefore be it resolved that CB2, Man. recommends:

Approval of the infill structures; and

**Denial** of the full window size sign as obtrusive and detracting from the historical character of the building and recommends back-painting the glass instead.



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

# COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org
P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village \* Little Italy \* SoHo \* NoHo \* Hudson Square \* Chinatown \* Gansevoort Market

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

3. **\*54 Morton St.** – Application is to convert a multi-family building into a single-family residence.

#### Whereas,

- A. Morton Street is an emblematic village Street with one of the most remarkably preserved rows to be found in the district on the south side of this block; and
- B. The facade paint is to be removed and restoration of masonry and brick carried out; and
- C. The proposed windows, though of an appropriate design, are in aluminum cladding where painted wood is the only acceptable historic material for this building; and
- D. A new areaway railing, represented by the applicant as inspired by the intricate intact historic parlor floor balcony, is of simple design with ornaments attached and reflects no historic period and detracts from the historic character of he building; and
- E. A stucco and glass penthouse (126 square feet) is placed near the center of the house and is plainly visible from several vantage points on Morton Street and minimally visible from the street to the south; and
- F. A small shift toward the rear of the house would render the penthouse not visible from Morton Street and somewhat visible through the block from the south; and
- G. Chimney extensions are in the usual design of similar extensions in the district and are not objectionable; and

- H. There is to be an excavation, which does not disturb the garden, below the extension to extend the cellar; and
- I. At the rear facade, a three floor extension and the two original floors above retain the original window placement on several floors and random reconfiguration on others; and
- J. The proposal to demolish much of original material in the rear facade and reconfigure the windows with folding window walls on the basement and fourth floors and non-historic single pane, aluminum frame windows with an industrial "U-Glass" that appears, from the proposal, to present an opaque view during the day in three punched configuration on the remaining floors; and
- K. The general design of the rear facade is without historic reference, apart from the three punched window configuration on some floors, and the single pane windows and folding window wall on the fourth floor completely disrespects the historic character of the building and the others in its row; and
- L. The design for the rear façade was represented by the owner, implausibly, as being justified as an intentional replacing of the intact, historic material and design with a modern design in order to give future generations a view of the time in which the renovation is being carried out.
- M. The doughnut is open through the block and is noted as one of the most well preserved and beautiful in the city and the introduction of this inappropriate facade is unacceptable and offensive; now

Therefore be it resolved that CB2, Man. recommends:

- A. Approval of the design for the restoration of the front facade brick and masonry; and
- B. **Denial** of the areaway fence design and the aluminum clad windows which require historically correct wood; and
- C. **Denial** of the penthouse unless is relocated toward the rear of the building to reduce considerably or eliminate the visibility from Morton Street; and
- D. Approval of the chimney extensions and excavation; and
- E. **Denial** of the complete rear facade design which involves demolition of considerable historical material and that it be replaced with a historically acceptable design, and that the applicant return to the Community Board for a public review of the revised design before the application is entertained by the Commission.



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

# COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

4. **\*29 Downing St. -** Application is to replace storefront, paint and repair the facade, and window replacement.

To be reviewed by staff



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

### COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

5. \*47-49 Greene St. – Application is to partially renovate the storefront to match existing retail, rooftop renovation and a glazed penthouse addition, and to raise the rear parapet to be level with the new rooftop structure.

### Whereas,

- A. The center four bays have been previously renovated under a prior application and are to be copied in style and color for the north and south bays; and
- B. The vault lights, presently covered in diamond plate will not be disturbed; and
- C. The north and south bays will have similar ADA compliant grade level doors in the style of the center bays with the unfortunate removal of a loading dock typical to the district at the existing freight elevator; and
- D. The bluestone sidewalk replacement will be restored and, where necessary, replaced in kind; and
- E. The existing equipment on the rooftop, including an iconic wooden water tank, will be removed and the roof will be flattened, resulting in an increased height of 5' at the rear and a new parapet will be installed; and
- F. The penthouse room is set back 21' from the facade and a minimal elevator bulkhead will replace the existing bulkhead and a glass railing is set back 10' and
- G. All of the rooftop structures are barely visible and not obtrusive; now

Therefore be it resolved that CB2, Man. recommends approval of this application.



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

# COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

6. \*79 8<sup>th</sup> Ave. - Application is to install 2 banners at the East elevation on 8<sup>th</sup> Ave. and 5 banners at the North elevation on 14<sup>th</sup> St.

#### Whereas,

- A. The well-preserved neoclassic bank building has its ground floor serving as a museum; and
- B. The proposed banners, hanging flat against the monumental pilasters, obscure the building, overwhelm the architecture and do great harm to the appearance of this historic building; and
- C. The proposed method of installation calls for an inordinate number of piercings of the facade to attach the aluminum frames; now

Therefore be it resolved that CB2, Man. strongly recommends denial of this application in that it obscures architectural features, detracts and distracts from the historic character of the building and the proposed method of installation would do harm to the fabric of the building.



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

### COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

7. \*251 6th Ave.-Application is to install a new open side awning with a loose skirt.

### Whereas,

- A. The existing awning, awkwardly installed just below the sills of the second floor windows, is in poor condition and missing its fabric in some places; and
- B. The proposed awning in bright red fabric is of minimal design and is attached two feet below the second floor windows which respects the proportions of the facade; now

Therefore be it resolved that CB2, Man. recommends approval of this application.



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

# COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org
P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org

Greenwich Village \* Little Italy \* SoHo \* NoHo \* Hudson Square \* Chinatown \* Gansevoort Market

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

- 8. \*133 W. 3<sup>rd</sup> St.-Application is to legalize the installation of a banner without LPC permits.
- A. A bright yellow banner is 27" wide by 84" high and replaces a banner of similar size; and
- B. The banner is attached with poles with diagonal braces at the top and bottom; now

**Be it resolved** that CB2, Man. recommends **approval** of this application provided that the anchoring of the poles and their braces is in the mortar joints and does not disturb historic material.



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

### COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org
P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org
Greenwich Village \* Little Italy \* SoHo \* NoHo \* Hudson Square \* Chinatown \* Gansevoort Market

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

9. \*770 Broadway – Application is to install new illuminated, cabinet signage for existing ground floor retail tenant to replace signage, which had been removed.

### Whereas,

- A. The business is reducing its space to a small corner portion of the building; and
- B. Assorted existing cabinet signs will be removed which will greatly improve the appearance of the building; and
- C. Two cabinet signs similar to the existing signs are 14'9" X 4'7" and are recessed into the bays and do not detract from the character of the building; now

Therefore be it resolved that CB2, Man. recommends approval of this application.



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

# COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org

 $P\colon 212\text{-}979\text{-}2272 \;\; F\colon 212\text{-}254\text{-}5102 \;\; E\colon info@cb2manhattan.org$   $Greenwich \; Village \; \star \; \; Little \; Italy \; \star \; \; SoHo \; \star \; \; NoHo \; \star \; \; Hudson \; Square \; \star \; \; Chinatown \; \; \star \; \; Gansevoort \; Market$ 

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

### 10. \*Discussion of Expense Budget Priorities for Fiscal Year 2020.

The budget request is for increased funding for identifying work carried out without approval and issuing violations and enforcement with respect to work that is not carried out in accordance with approved plans



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

# COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

### SECOND LANDMARKS MEETING

**11.** \*272-278 W. 10th St. - Application is to construct an addition to the existing Village Community School on the site of the school's existing playground and classroom outbuilding, to be demolished

#### Whereas:

- A. The lot proposed for the building is a fenced in playground for the school with a utilitarian garage from the 1950s which has been modified; and
- B. The two existing school buildings on the block are a heavily articulated 1886 school building in the center of the block and a 2003 addition; and
- C. The proposed building would completely fill the open unbuilt area providing classrooms, studios, a gymnasium, and a top floor outdoor play area and would complete the block-long campus; and
- D. The building would obscure the historic wall (shown in the 1940's tax photo) of a warehouse building located to the south of the property on Greenwich Street with its distinctive pattern of windows; and
- E. There is new mechanical equipment located on the original building with the addition of a brick enclosure adjacent to the existing elevator shaft- all of which is unobjectionably visible through the play yard mesh; and

- F. The building to the east of the original building called "the connector" has a glass wall with a thin grid of metal framing, no masonry, or top termination or cornice, or other solid relief from the glass void; and
- G. The connector unduly asserts itself with a monolithic modern, industrial window wall revealing a staircase and a mural of student art work behind it, is totally without historic reference and not convincing in the rationale presented. Simply not in harmony with the existing school buildings nor the neighborhood; and
- H. The proposed building fills the entire open lot with a ground floor of some solid masonry and glass sections, above are two floors of classrooms and a fourth floor with similar openings with mesh in place of windows since it functionally a new open air play area; and
- I. Though the building has a certain subtle richness in the details- such as in the recess of the windows and other masonry detailing, the very strong overall grid overpowers these details. The rectangular grid is at odds with the district comprised of solid masonry walls with punched window openings and decorative trim and it lacks historic reference or reference to the existing school buildings. The lack of reflecting the neighborhood's architectural character in the glass connector, as well as the rhythm and ratio of solid to void of the building, including the ground floor and the overly large "show" windows on three floors of the Greenwich Street façade (that presume to define a "correction" to the trapezoidal layout of the block); and
- J. The windows and the mullion layout with a single pane to one side and two panes to the other side are without historic reference and present a jumbled aspect to the façade; and
- K. The lack of top termination or a cornice of the building reinforces the predominantly modern appearance and places it at odds with the existing buildings of the school and block; and
- L. There was considerable testimony from those associated with the school in favor of the application and considerable testimony from other members of the public opposed to the application; and
- M. The proposed building is an unwelcome neighbor to the existing original building,-and a neighborhood rich in the variety of its buildings both modest row houses and commercial structures and large warehouses and other industrial building; and
- N. The applicant spoke of the proposal as "playful", "breaking the mold" and "illustrating to the students that rules can be broken", and "opening the school to the neighborhood" and these are unconvincing justifications for the building's departure from historic precedent in its design and the other departures from the norms of historic preservation in a designated district.

### Therefore be it resolved that CB2, Man. recommends:

- A. **Approval** of the demolition of the garage structure; and
- B. That the proposal for the building be **denied** and that revisions, taking into consideration the comments in the "whereas "clauses of this resolution, be made to the application and that the revised version be presented to the Landmarks Committee of CB2, Man. for review prior to its being presented to the Landmarks Commission for its consideration.

Vote: Passed, with 33 Board members in favor, 4 in opposition (R. Chatree, J. Liff, R. Sanz, A. Zeldin), and 5 abstentions (S. Aaron, D. Miller, S. Sartiano, G. Seamans Silvera, S. Smith).



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

# COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

12. \*130 Greene St. – Application is to install a painted advertising sign over an existing shadow sign on the sidewall.

### Whereas:

- A. The referenced ghost sign, evident in a historical photograph, has completely disappeared over time an no vestige remains; and
- B. The sign will occupy approximately the same area as the no longer extant ghost sign; now

**Therefore be it resolved** that CB2, Man. recommends **approval** of this application provided the design and placement conform to zoning and landmark regulations and that staff review each design to ensure that these regulations are adhered to.



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

# COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

- 13. \*114 Washington Pl. Application is to modify the rear sloped roof to create a flat roof terrace and location for mechanical equipment.
- A. The rear façade is to be rebuilt with non-historic three part windows on the east side which are barely visible from any vantage point in the doughnut and the extension will be converted to a stair tower with two additional windows; and
- B. The roof is to be leveled to provide proper head height on the top floor, placement of mechanical, a deck at the rear and stair bulkhead. The roof alteration and the rooftop equipment are not visible from any public thoroughfare; and
- C. The change in the roof regrettably results in the removal of the original sloped roof and single dormer at the rear of the building; and
- D. The flattening of the roof with the unfortunate loss of the dormer necessary to make the top floor of the building habitable; and
- F. The chimney extension is minimally and unobtrusively visible from Washington Place; now

Therefore be it resolved that CB2, Man. recommends approval of this resolution.



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

### COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 WASHINGTON SQUARE VILLAGE NEW YORK, NY 10012-1899 www.cb2manhattan.org

October 19, 2018

Frederick Bland, Interim Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission One Centre St., 9<sup>th</sup> Floor North New York, New York 10007

Dear Chair Bland:

At its Full Board meeting on October 18, 2018, Community Board #2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.) adopted the following resolution:

- 14. **\*53 Mercer St.** Application is to construct a 4<sup>th</sup> floor plus 5<sup>th</sup> floor mezzanine setback penthouse addition with minimal visibility on an existing 3-story building.
- A. The addition is two floors located at the rear of the building clad in charcoal gray metal; and
- B. The addition is minimally visible over the two story building to the south otherwise obscured by taller buildings; and
- C. A glass safety railing is minimally visible from a public thoroughfare; and
- D. The new fourth floor is set back from the street façade 20' and the fifth floor is 38'; and
- E. The rear façade is be restored with one door and two windows at the lowest level and traditional three punched windows on the upper with existing shutters maintained; and
- F. A replacement skylight, smaller than the existing one, will be installed in the same location; and
- G. The front ground floor infill is in wood with an 18" bulkhead, a central show window, and symmetrical doorways at the north and south and a stone coursing above; now

Therefore be it resolved that CB2, Man. recommends approval of this application.

Please advise us of any decision or action taken in response to this resolution.

Sincerely,

Terri Cude, Chair

Community Board #2, Manhattan

Chenault Spence, Chair

Landmarks & Public Aesthetics Committee

Community Board #2, Manhattan

TC/fa

c: Hon. Jerrold L. Nadler, Congressman

Hon. Nydia M. Velazquez, Congresswoman

Hon. Carolyn Maloney, Congresswoman

Hon. Brad Hoylman, NY State Senator

Hon. Brian Kavanagh, NY State Senator

Hon. Deborah J. Glick, Assembly Member

Hon. Yuh-Line Niou, Assembly Member

Hon. Gale A, Brewer, Man. Borough President

Hon. Corey Johnson, Council Speaker

Hon. Margaret Chin, Council Member

Hon. Carlina Rivera, Council Member

Ali Rasoulinejad, Director of Government & Community Relations, LPC

Amber Novak, External Affairs Coordinator, LPC